See discussions, stats, and author profiles for this publication at: https://www.researchgate.net/publication/375065939

DNA fragments detected in monovalent and bivalent Pfizer/BioNTech and Moderna modRNA COVID-19 vaccines from Ontario, Canada: Exploratory dose response relationship with serious adv...



1	DNA fragmen	ts detected in monovalent and bivalent							
2	Pfizer/BioNTech	and Moderna modRNA COVID-19 vaccines							
3	from Ontario	o, Canada: Exploratory dose response							
4	relations	ship with serious adverse events.							
5									
6	David J. Speicher ¹ , Jessica Rose ² , L. Maria Gutschi ³ , David Wiseman ⁴ ,								
7		Kevin McKernan ⁵							
8									
9	¹ Department of Pathobiolo	ogy, University of Guelph, Guelph, Ontario, Canada							
10	² Independent Researcher, Ontario, Canada ORCID 0000-0002-9091-4425								
11	³ Pharmacy Consultant, Ottawa, Ontario, Canada								
12	⁴ Synechion, Inc., Dallas, Texas, USA ORCID 0000-0002-8367-6158								
13	⁵ Medicinal Genomics, Beverly, MA, USA ORCID 0000-0002-3908-1122								
14									
15	Corresponding Author:	Dr. David J. Speicher							
16	ι	Jniversity of Guelph							
17	Ę	50 Stone Rd E, Guelph, ON, N1G 2W1							
18	S	speicher@uoguelph.ca							
19	(ORCID 0000-0002-1745-3263							
20									
21	Keywords: COVID-19, va	ccines, DNA contamination, impurity, residual DNA, modRNA,							
22	mRNA, adverse events								

23 Abstract

24 **Background:** In vitro transcription (IVT) reactions used to generate nucleoside modified 25 RNA (modRNA) for SARS-CoV-2 vaccines currently rely on an RNA polymerase 26 transcribing from a DNA template. Production of modRNA used in the original Pfizer 27 randomized clinical trial (RCT) utilized a PCR-generated DNA template (Process 1). To 28 generate billions of vaccine doses, this DNA was cloned into a bacterial plasmid vector 29 for amplification in Escherichia coli before linearization (Process 2), expanding the size 30 and complexity of potential residual DNA and introducing sequences not present in the 31 Process 1 template. It appears that Moderna used a similar plasmid-based process for 32 both clinical trial and post-trial use vaccines. Recently, DNA sequencing studies have 33 revealed this plasmid DNA at significant levels in both Pfizer-BioNTech and Moderna 34 modRNA vaccines. These studies surveyed a limited number of lots and questions remain 35 regarding the variance in residual DNA observed internationally.

Methods: Using previously published primer and probe sequences, quantitative 36 37 polymerase chain reaction (qPCR) and Qubit[®] fluorometry was performed on an 38 additional 27 mRNA vials obtained in Canada and drawn from 12 unique lots (5 lots of 39 Moderna child/adult monovalent, 1 lot of Moderna adult bivalent BA.4/5, 1 lot of Moderna 40 child/adult bivalent BA.1, 1 lot of Moderna XBB.1.5 monovalent, 3 lots of Pfizer adult 41 monovalent, and 1 lot of Pfizer adult bivalent BA.4/5). The Vaccine Adverse Events 42 Reporting System (VAERS) database was queried for the number and categorization of 43 adverse events (AEs) reported for each of the lots tested. The content of one previously 44 studied vial of Pfizer COVID-19 vaccine was examined by Oxford Nanopore sequencing 45 to determine the size distribution of DNA fragments. This sample was also used to 46 determine if the residual DNA is packaged in the lipid nanoparticles (LNPs) and thus 47 resistant to DNasel or if the DNA resides outside of the LNP and is DNasel labile.

48 **Results:** Quantification cycle (Cq) values (1:10 dilution) for the plasmid origin of 49 replication (ori) and spike sequences ranged from 18.44 - 24.87 and 18.03 - 23.83 and 50 for Pfizer, and 22.52 – 24.53 and 25.24 – 30.10 for Moderna, respectively. These values 51 correspond to 0.28 - 4.27 ng/dose and 0.22 - 2.43 ng/dose (Pfizer), and 0.01 -0.34 52 ng/dose and 0.25 – 0.78 ng/dose (Moderna), for ori and spike respectively measured by 53 gPCR, and 1,896 – 3,720 ng/dose and 3,270 – 5,100 ng/dose measured by Qubit[®] 54 fluorometry for Pfizer and Moderna, respectfully. The SV40 promoter-enhancer-ori was 55 only detected in Pfizer vials with Cq scores ranging from 16.64 – 22.59. In an exploratory 56 analysis, we found preliminary evidence of a dose response relationship of the amount of 57 DNA per dose and the frequency of serious adverse events (SAEs). This relationship was 58 different for the Pfizer and Moderna products. Size distribution analysis found mean and 59 maximum DNA fragment lengths of 214 base pairs (bp) and 3.5 kb, respectively. The 60 plasmid DNA is likely inside the LNPs and is protected from nucleases.

61 **Conclusion:** These data demonstrate the presence of billions to hundreds of billions of 62 DNA molecules per dose in these vaccines. Using fluorometry, all vaccines exceed the 63 guidelines for residual DNA set by FDA and WHO of 10 ng/dose by 188 – 509-fold. 64 However, qPCR residual DNA content in all vaccines were below these guidelines 65 emphasizing the importance of methodological clarity and consistency when interpreting 66 quantitative guidelines. The preliminary evidence of a dose-response effect of residual 67 DNA measured with qPCR and SAEs warrant confirmation and further investigation. Our 68 findings extend existing concerns about vaccine safety and call into question the 69 relevance of guidelines conceived before the introduction of efficient transfection using 70 LNPs. With several obvious limitations, we urge that our work is replicated under forensic 71 conditions and that guidelines be revised to account for highly efficient DNA transfection 72 and cumulative dosing.

73 Introduction

74 To produce large amounts of modified RNA (modRNA) vaccine for generalized use, Pfizer 75 changed its manufacturing process (Process 1) used to produce material for the 76 randomized clinical trial (RCT)¹ to a process (Process 2) similar to the one already being used by Moderna. The SARS-CoV-2 spike sequence was cloned into a plasmid 77 78 containing a bacterial origin of replication (generically termed ori) active in Escherichia 79 coli. This plasmid (7,824 base pairs (bp) and 6,777 bp for Pfizer and Moderna, 80 respectively) also contains an aminoglycoside phosphotransferase gene (Neo/Kan) that 81 allows cost effective bacterial replication in a broth containing kanamycin and a doubling 82 of plasmid copy number every 30 minutes at 37°C. The E. coli cells are then harvested 83 and lysed. DNA is extracted and linearized with the restriction enzyme *Eam*1104I. This 84 linear DNA then acts as the template for T7 RNA Polymerase *in vitro* transcription (IVT) 85 in the presence of N1-methyl-pseudouridine. After the IVT, DNA is hydrolyzed, reducing 86 its prevalence in the final drug product. Documents leaked from the European Medicines 87 Agency (EMA) and cited in the British Medical Journal² noted that residual DNA in 88 modRNA products made by this process could vary significantly³.

89

90 McKernan et al. performed next-generation RNA sequencing of these vaccines and, 91 unexpectedly, found evidence of DNA derived from the expression plasmids used during 92 manufacturing.⁴ McKernan et al. then developed a quantitative polymerase chain reaction 93 (qPCR) method towards the DNA contamination with primers targeting shared sequences 94 in both Pfizer and Moderna vaccines.⁴ Additionally, McKernan et al., found SV40 95 promoter-enhancer-ori, and SV40 polyA signal sequences in the Pfizer vaccines. To 96 investigate the generalizability of these findings to other lots of vaccines, we obtained 24 97 unopened expired vials (8 Pfizer and 16 Moderna) and three vials of in-date remnants of 98 Moderna XBB.1.5 COVID-19 vaccines that had been distributed in Ontario, Canada and 99 examined them via Qubit[®] fluorometry and qPCR targeting spike, plasmid ori, and the 100 SV40 promoter-enhancer-ori. We then queried the Vaccine Adverse Event Reporting 101 System (VAERS) for any adverse events (AEs), including serious AEs (SAEs), associated 102 with these lots.⁵ We also extended the observations of an earlier work (McKernan et al.⁴) 103 by studying the size distribution of DNA fragments as well as the DNasel sensitivity of the

104 vaccine to determine whether the residual DNA is packaged in the LNPs.

105

For the purpose of this study, we are using the terms "residual DNA," "DNA mass," (or
similar) rather than "impurity" or "contamination" as a discussion of these regulatory terms
is beyond the scope of this paper.

109

110 Methods

111

112 COVID-19 Vaccines Tested

113 Expired unopened vials of Pfizer-BioNTech BNT162b2 (n=8) and Moderna Spikevax 114 mRNA-1273 (n=16) were obtained from various pharmacies in Ontario, Canada (Figure 115 1). Three vials of in-date remnants of the same lot of Moderna XBB.1.5 vaccine were also 116 obtained. In total, 12 lots were surveyed across 27 mRNA vials: 5 lots of Moderna 117 child/adult monovalent, 1 lot of Moderna adult bivalent BA.4/5, 1 lot of Moderna child/adult 118 bivalent Wuhan-BA.1, 1 lot of Moderna XBB.1.5 monovalent, 3 lots of Pfizer adult 119 monovalent, and 1 lot of Pfizer adult bivalent Wuhan-BA.4/5 vaccines. An unopened 120 sterile injectable vial of alprostadil 66 mcg/mL in combination with papaverine 21.7mg/mL 121 and phentolamine 1 mg/mL (TriMix) was used as the negative control. The unopened 122 vials were untampered as they had intact flip-off plastic caps with printed lot numbers and 123 expiration dates. Vials had been stored in a purpose-built vaccine unit at +2-8°C in the 124 pharmacies and were transported in insulated containers with frozen gel packs and 125 placed in the testing laboratory fridge within 5 hours. Only one Moderna vial did not have 126 a printed expiration date but had a QR code that required scanning by a pharmacist. The 127 Moderna XBB.1.5 vials were similarly stored by the pharmacy. Vials were removed from 128 the refrigerator, warmed for ~20 minutes, and administered by the pharmacist to patients 129 over ~30 minutes. The remnant vials were placed in an insulated container with frozen 130 gel packs and transported to the testing laboratory fridge within 12 hours.



131

Figure 1. Vials of COVID-19 vaccine from Ontario, Canada: (A) Pfizer/BioNTech
BNT162b2 adult monovalent and bivalent; Moderna Spikevax mRNA-1273 (B) adult
monovalent XBB.1.5, (C) child/adult monovalent, (D) child/adult bivalent Wuhan-BA.1
and (E) child/adult bivalent Wuhan-BA.1 and adult Wuhan-bivalent BA.4/5.

136

137 qPCR Analysis of Spike, ori, and the SV40 Promoter-Enhancer-ori DNA

138 Each vial was tested by quantitative PCR (qPCR) for the presence of plasmid derived 139 SARS-CoV-2 spike, ori, and the SV40 promoter-enhancer-ori DNA. Spike and plasmid 140 *ori* were tested in duplicate with PCR primers targeting sequences shared by the Moderna 141 and Pfizer expression plasmids (Table 1). The uniplex SV40 Enhancer assay was 142 designed to amplify the nuclear targeting sequence unique to the Pfizer vector⁶. In brief, 143 the qPCR assays used 1 µL from each vial directly added to 17.8 µL of master mix. qPCR 144 kits were sourced from Medicinal Genomics (Part# 420201, Beverly, USA) with the 145 master mix containing 8.8 µL reaction consisting of 3.8 µL polymerase enzyme, 0.8 µL 146 reaction buffer and 1.0 µL of Primer-Probe mix, and 12.2 µL of ddH₂0. The Primer-Probe 147 mix was assembled using 12.5 µL 100 µM ori probe, 12.5 µL of 100 µM spike probe, 25 148 µL of 100 µM spike forward primer, 25 µL of 100 µM spike reverse primer, 25 µL of 100 149 μ M *ori* forward primer, 25 μ L 100 μ M *ori* reverse primer, and 75 μ L of ddH₂0.

- 151 Spike and ori qPCR assays used a synthetic gDNA control (gBlock, Integrated DNA
- 152 Technologies (IDT), San Diego, USA) of known concentration to generate a 10-fold serial
- 153 dilution derived calibration curve. The SV40 enhancer gBlock failed initial synthesis and
- 154 a standard curve could not be produced.
- 155
- **Table 1.** Primer and probe sequences targeting spike, ori, and the SV40 promoter.

Primer-Probe Name	Sequence							
MedGen-Moderna_Pfizer_Janssen_Vax-Spike_Forward	AGATGGCCTACCGGTTCA							
MedGen-Moderna_Pfizer_Janssen_Vax-Spike_Reverse	TCAGGCTGTCCTGGATCTT							
MedGen-Moderna_Pfizer_Janssen_Vax-Spike_Probe	/56-FAM/CGAGAACCA/ZEN/GAAGCTGATCGCCAA/3IABkFQ/							
MedGen_Vax-vector_Ori_Forward	CTACATACCTCGCTCTGCTAATC							
MedGen_Vax-vector_Ori_Reverse	GCGCCTTATCCGGTAACTATC							
MedGen_Vax-vector_Ori_Probe	/5HEX/AAGACACGA/ZEN/CTTATCGCCACTGGC/3IABkFQ/							
MedGen_SV40_Enhancer_Forward	GTCAGTTAGGGTGTGGAAAGT							
MedGen_SV40_Enhancer_Reverse	GGTTGCTGACTAATTGAGATGC							
MedGen_SV40_Enhancer_Probe	/5TEX615/CCAGCAGGCAGAAGTATGCAAAGC/3IAbRQSp/							

157 158

159 Cycling was performed on a QuantStudio 3 (ThermoFisher Scientific, Waltham, USA) with 160 an initial denaturation of 95°C for 3 minutes followed by 35 cycles of 95°C for 10 seconds 161 and 65°C for 30 seconds. Cq conversion to ng/µL was calculated using the QuantStudio 162 software v2.7.0 (ThermoFisher Scientific). Amplicon mass, as determined with the New 163 England BioLabs DNA calculator,⁷ and length (105 bp for *ori*, 114 bp for spike) were used 164 to estimate the total nanograms (ng) of DNA present by adjusting for the length of the 165 plasmids (7,824bp for Pfizer and 6,777bp for Moderna). Copy number per dose was 166 adjusted for the volume of each intramuscular vaccine injection (300 µL for Pfizer and 167 500 µL for Moderna). Serial dilutions were performed on the three Pfizer lots that showed 168 the highest residual DNA concentration. to investigate PCR inhibition by the LNPs since 169 qPCR was performed directly without any treatment or extraction.

170

171 Qubit[®] fluorometry quantitation

AccuGreen[®] HS fluorometric reagents (AccuGreen #99820 and DNA Quantification Buffer #99979) and standards were acquired from Biotium (San Francisco, USA) for Qubit[®] analysis (ThermoFisher Scientific). Fluorometric reagents (190 μ L of a stock made from 995 μ L HS Buffer and 5 μ L 200X AccuGreen dye) were vortexed with 10 μ L of vaccine. These samples were heated to 95°C for 8 minutes and 4°C for 5 minutes to disrupt the LNPs and enable Fluorometric Dyes to access the DNA. Samples were read
following the manufacturer's instructions on a Qubit 3.0 Fluorometer. Qubit fluorometry
and qPCR data were compared.

180

181 Vaccine Adverse Event Reporting System (VAERS) Data

182 The VAERS database was analyzed using the Language and Environment for Statistical Computing package in R⁸ and included data spanning December 17, 2020 through 183 184 October 6, 2023 The VAERS data is available for download in three separate comma 185 separated values (csv) data files representing: i) general data for each report; ii) the 186 reported AEs or 'symptoms', and iii) vaccine data including vaccine manufacturer and lot 187 number.⁵ A VAERS ID number is assigned to preserve confidentiality when a report is 188 filed. To assess the AEs related to a particular vaccine, it is necessary to merge the three 189 data files using the VAERS IDs as a linking variable. For this study, since we are 190 interested in the COVID-19 products, only COVID-19 vaccine type (COVID19-1 191 (monovalent) and COVID19-2 (bivalent)) were included. Other relevant variables included 192 VAERS ID*, vaccine lot (VAX LOT), vaccine manufacturer (VAX MANU), 193 hospitalizations (HOSPITAL) and deaths (DIED). Data were grouped by vaccine lot and 194 the total number of AE and SAE reports were counted. SAE reports included deaths, 195 hospitalizations, emergency room visits, disability reports, birth defects and life-196 threatening reports, and individual MedDRA coded AEs, such as total deaths per lot, were 197 also counted.

198

199 The various limitations of VAERS are widely acknowledged, for example by FDA⁹, and 200 include underreporting, misreporting, spontaneous reporting, and the inability to infer 201 causality. Nevertheless, to explore a possible dose-response relationship between 202 residual DNA content and SAEs, we used the ratio of the number of SAE reports to the 203 total number of AEs ("SAE reporting ratio" = SRR) as a proxy for a possible toxicological 204 effect. We used the total number of AEs reported by lot as a proxy for the total number of 205 doses administered, since this denominator is difficult to estimate. This principle is used 206 by the CDC in disproportionality signal analysis (DSA) to identify safety signals using the

207 Proportional Reporting Ratio (PRR)¹⁰ The PRR, as devised by Evans *et al.*, is a useful
208 tool in pharmacovigilance with known limitations.¹¹

209

210 It must be noted that although VAERS is a USA-based database, it accepts reports from 211 around the world. Certain categories of AEs that are reported to manufacturers outside 212 the USA, must be reported to the VAERS database. Differences in propensity for 213 underreporting as well as mandatory reporting imposed on manufacturers or medical 214 professionals within and outside the USA may introduce confounding to the estimation of 215 the SRR. Accordingly, for our exploratory dose-response analysis we only used VAERS 216 data originating outside the USA to reduce this confounding. Additionally, we have noted 217 some discrepancies in data obtained through the downloaded version of the VAERS 218 dataset, and those obtained using the VAERS WONDER front-end web-based interface 219 (https://wonder.cdc.gov/controller/datarequest/D8). We used the downloaded version as 220 it provides greater detail than the web version. The SRR was then plotted against levels 221 of DNA found in the vials to identify any association between residual DNA levels and the 222 frequency of reports of serious adverse events.

223

Where more than one vial was available in any lot, the average mass of residual DNA per dose for that lot was used. Zero values of SRR for any given lot were only plotted if one or more AEs had been identified worldwide, signifying that that lot had actually been deployed. The curves were plotted on a logarithmic axis and a trend line drawn using the linear function within Microsoft[®] Excel.

229

230 Oxford Nanopore Sequencing

In a separate experiment using previously sequenced vaccine⁴ (Pfizer children's monovalent Lot# FL8095), DNA fragment size distributions were estimated using an Oxford Nanopore Flongle (R.10.4.1, Oxford Nanopore Technologies (ONT), New York, USA) and the Oxford Nanopore Ligation sequencing kit (SQK-LSK114) according to the manufacturer's instructions. Reads were mapped to NCBI OR134577.1 with the BurrowWheeler Aligner with maximum exact matches (BWA-MEM).¹² ONT sequencing read

length is unlimited, but the DNA isolation procedures can bias the length of the molecules
captured in the ONT ligation reaction. Single molecule reads were counted and binned
according to their mapped read length with BWA-MEM.

240

241 Nuclease sensitivity of the vaccines

The same vial (Pfizer Lot# FL8095) was used to assess DNasel sensitivity of the vaccine by determining if the DNA contamination is packaged in the LNP and thus resistant to DNasel or if the DNA resides outside of the LNP and is DNasel labile.

245

246 Nuclease protected DNA was estimated by treating 20 µL of the vaccine with 2.5 µL of 247 DNaseI-XT (2 units/µL, NEB#M0570S, New England BioLabs Inc, Ipswich, USA), 2.5 µL 248 of Grim Reefer 10X buffer (Medicinal Genomics #420123-125) and incubating at 37°C for 249 30 minutes. For the control, 2.5 µL of ddH₂0 was used instead of the DNasel-XT. The 250 DNasel-XT reaction was chemically arrested using 2.5 µL of MGC lysis buffer (Medicinal 251 Genomics #420001). After the DNasel chemical kill step, a qPCR amplifiable internal 252 control DNA was spiked-in to verify that the DNaseI-XT had been fully inactivated 253 (Medicinal Genomics #420123-125).

254

255 After spiking in the DNasel inactivation control, 54 µL of SenSATIVAx magnetic beads 256 (Medicinal Genomics) were used to purify DNA from the DNasel-XT assay and the 257 DNaseI-XT negative control samples. The magnetic beads were pipette mixed 10 times 258 with the sample, incubated at room temperature for 5 minutes, magnetically separated 259 and washed twice with 70% v/v ethanol. The ethanol was removed, and the beads dried 260 for 2 minutes at room temperature. Samples were eluted in 30 µL of ddH₂0 and 1 µL of 261 eluate was examined by qPCR for spike and ori in an 18.8 µL reaction. An additional 262 DNasel inactivation control primer and probe (0.5 µL in CY5) were added to the assay for 263 a total of 19.3 µL reaction.

264

265 **Results**

An 8-log serial dilution standard curve was used to calibrate sample Cq values and generated R² values of 0.998 and 0.999 for spike and *ori* amplicons, respectively. PCR

Speicher DJ et al, DNA fragments detected in COVID-19 vaccines in Canada. 10

efficiency was 99.8% and 94.7% for spike and *ori,* respectively (Figure 2). On all plates, negative controls and no template (ddH₂0) controls (NTC) were tested in triplicate and found to be negative.

271



272

Figure 2. Calibration curves of Spike (red) and ori (blue) diluted 10-fold and tested by qPCR.

For individual vials, qPCR on Pfizer amplified at a similar time for spike, *ori*, and SV40 enhancer-promoter-*ori* ($_{\Delta}$ Cq 1.48 ± 0.32) (Figure 3). Apart from Pfizer lot: FX4343, the inter vial difference was small for both Pfizer (spike Cq 16.91 ± 0.52; *ori* Cq 16.91 ± 1.07; SV40 promoter-enhancer-*ori* Cq 15.46 ± 2.02) and Moderna (spike Cq 20.35 ± 0.65; *ori* Cq 25.34 ± 1.47) (values were based on the undiluted vials contents) (Table 2, Figure 4) However, for all Moderna vials, except lot AS0467D, *ori* consistently amplified Cq 5-6 later than spike. The SV40 promoter-enhancer-*ori* was detected in all Pfizer vials but in

283 none of the Moderna vials.



284

Figure 3. The amplification curve for spike (red), ori (blue), and SV40 enhancer-promoter ori (green) in a single vial of Pfizer (Lot: Fx4343a) from two different wells of the same
 PCR run.



Figure 4. Amplification plot of all Pfizer (A) and Moderna (B) vials showing that spike (red) and ori (blue) amplified similarly for individual vials of Pfizer. In Moderna, inter-vial variability was consistent, but spike amplified earlier than ori (Δ Cq~6).

Table 2. Details of the vaccine vials, adverse events (AEs) identified, and qPCR testing results for SARS-CoV-2 spike, ori, and the SV40 promoter-enhancer-ori on all Pfizer-BioNTech and Moderna vials tested. Calculations for Pfizer and Moderna were based on adult doses of 0.30 mL and 0.50 mL, respectively. Moderna is also indicated to be given to children aged 6-12 years of age with a dose 0.25 mL making the resultant total ng/dose half of that given to adults. Total ng/dose is adjusted for the length of the amplicon (105 bp ori, 114 bp spike) only representing a fraction of the 7,824 bp Pfizer and 6,777 bp Moderna plasmid.

Vaccine Information					VAERS Data		Spike			Ori		
Manufacturer	Туре	Lot Number *	Printed Expiry Date	Total AES	Total SAEs	Cq	Total ng/dose	Total Copies/dose	Cq	Total ng/dose	Total Copies/dose	Cq
Pfizer-BioNTech	Adult Monovalent	FM7380	02/2022	29	15	18.03	2.43	2.07E+10	18.57	3.92	1.86E+11	17.19
Pfizer-BioNTech	Adult Monovalent	FN7934a	08/2022	42	21	18.47	1.79	1.53E+10	18.77	3.43	1.62E+11	16.64
Pfizer-BioNTech	Adult Monovalent	FN7934b	02/2022			18.19	2.18	1.86E+10	18.44	4.27	3.96E+10	16.96
Pfizer-BioNTech	Adult Monovalent	FX4343a	08/2022	1	0	23.53	0.27	2.30E+09	24.71	0.32	2.94E+09	20.64
Pfizer-BioNTech	Adult Monovalent	FX4343b	07/2022			23.83	0.22	1.86E+09	24.87	0.28	2.64E+09	22.59
Pfizer-BioNTech	Adult Bivalent	GK0932a	09/2022	3	0	20.46	2.25	1.92E+10	21.01	3.81	3.54E+10	18.53
Pfizer-BioNTech	Adult Bivalent	GK0932b	09/2022			20.60	2.05	1.75E+10	21.22	3.32	3.08E+10	18.91
Pfizer-BioNTech	Adult Bivalent	GK0932c	09/2022			20.66	1.97	1.68E+10	21.21	3.33	3.09E+10	18.6
Moderna	Child/Adult Monovalent	020E21A	None Stated	5	1	23.66	0.35	3.02E+09	29.47	0.02	1.87E+08	Neg
Moderna	Child/Adult Monovalent	020J21A	30/032022	7	5	23.21	0.48	4.12E+09	30.10	0.01	1.23E+08	Neg
Moderna	Child/Adult Monovalent	033M21Aa	22/06/2022	2	1	23.04	0.54	4.65E+09	29.46	0.02	1.88E+08	Neg
Moderna	Child/Adult Monovalent	033M21Ab	30/07/2022			22.81	0.64	5.44E+09	29.38	0.02	1.99E+08	Neg
Moderna	Child/Adult Monovalent	033M21Ac	30/03/2022			23.59	0.37	3.18E+09	29.87	0.02	1.43E+08	Neg
Moderna	Child/Adult Monovalent	033M21Ad	30/07/2022			23.26	0.47	3.98E+09	29.39	0.02	1.97E+08	Neg
Moderna	Child/Adult Monovalent	055K21A	30/07/2022	2	2	22.94	0.58	4.98E+09	29.58	0.02	1.74E+08	Neg
Moderna	Child/Adult Monovalent	062H21Aa	30/07/2022	9	3	22.52	0.78	6.69E+09	29.21	0.02	2.23E+08	Neg
Moderna	Child/Adult Monovalent	062H21Ab	28/05/2022			22.76	0.66	5.64E+09	29.37	0.02	2.00E+08	Neg
Moderna	Adult Bivalent BA.4/5	AT0709Ba	30/07/2023	0	0	23.68	0.35	2.99E+09	29.30	0.02	2.09E+08	Neg
Moderna	Adult Bivalent BA.4/5	AT0709Bb	30/07/2023			23.56	0.38	3.24E+09	29.25	0.02	2.16E+08	Neg
Moderna	Adult Bivalent BA.4/5	AT0709Bc	30/07/2023			23.63	0.36	3.09E+09	29.34	0.02	2.04E+08	Neg
Moderna	Adult Bivalent BA.4/5	AT0709Bd	30/07/2023			23.80	0.32	2.74E+09	29.44	0.02	1.91E+08	Neg
Moderna	Child/Adult Bivalent BA.1	AS0467Da	02/04/2023	0	0	23.20	0.49	4.17E+09	25.24	0.34	3.20E+09	Neg
Moderna	Child/Adult Bivalent BA.1	AS0467Db	02/04/2023			24.16	0.25	2.14E+09	26.08	0.20	1.82E+09	Neg
Moderna	Child/Adult Bivalent BA.1	AS0467Dc	02/04/2023			23.75	0.33	2.85E+09	25.74	0.25	2.28E+09	Neg
Moderna	Adult Monovalent XBB.1.5	020G23Aa	29/04/2024	0	0	24.42	0.73	6.26E+09	29.42	0.03	3.18E+08	Neg
Moderna	Adult Monovalent XBB.1.5	020G23Ab	29/04/2024			24.46	0.71	6.11E+09	29.87	0.03	2.33E+08	Neg
Moderna	Adult Monovalent XBB.1.5	020G23Ac	29/04/2024			24.53	0.68	5.84E+09	29.74	0.03	2.55E+08	Neg

298 *Lower case letters at the end of lot numbers indicate different vials of the same lot. *SV40 promoter-enhancer-ori

Speicher DJ et al, DNA fragments detected in COVID-19 vaccines in Canada. 14

299 DNA content in none of the Moderna and three Pfizer lots exceeded 1 ng/dose for either 300 spike or plasmid ori. Vaccine in these three vials was diluted 10-fold serially to assess 301 LNP inhibition in qPCR (Figure 5). We observed the expected ~3.3 Cq response after 302 the 1:10 dilution (1:10, 1:100, 1:1000) suggesting that there is some LNP inhibition that 303 could impact the quantitation of DNA at these dilutions (Figure 6). Therefore, the data 304 from the 1:10 dilutions were used for further analysis. This dilution, as well as the fact 305 that some of the doses were designed to be diluted before use, was accounted for in our 306 calculations.



307

Figure 5. Comparison of residual DNA content of spike (red) and *ori* (blue) and the total number of adverse events (orange) reported to VAERS. The FDA and WHO regulatory guideline of 10 ng/dose^{13 14} for residual DNA is shown by a red dotted line. Vials are sorted in descending order by DNA load of plasmid ori. Lower case letters at the end of lot numbers indicate different vials of the same lot. The total number of AEs was determined per lot and reproduced for each vial in the same lot.





Figure 6. qPCR amplification profiles from the serial dilutions (10-fold) of the three lots
 containing the highest DNA loads (Pfizer lots: A, FN7934a; B, FN7934b; C, FM7380).

317

The amount of residual DNA varied substantially between lots (0.28 - 4.27 ng/dose for Pfizer *ori*, 0.22 - 2.43 ng/dose for Pfizer spike, 0.01 - 0.34 ng/dose for Moderna *ori*, 0.25-0.78 ng/dose for Moderna spike) when tested by qPCR. Fluorometer based measurements (e.g., Qubit[®]) of the vaccines show 2,567 ± 618 ng/dose (range: 1,896 to 3,720 ng/dose) for Pfizer and 4,280 ± 593 ng/dose (range: 3,270 to 5,100 ng/dose) for Moderna suggesting a high fraction of the DNA is under the size range of the qPCR amplicons.

325

We plotted residual DNA values obtained by Qubit fluorometry against those obtained by qPCR (Figure 7). For the Pfizer product, the trend lines for *ori* and spike estimates both had a positive slope. The graph for the Moderna product differs from that of the Pfizer product with little overlap of values in either axis, with much shallower slopes. Although a detailed view of the Moderna plots suggests a negative slope for the ori values, this trendline may be influenced by three outlying values. These values wereobtained from vials of the Moderna BA.1-Wuhan bivalent vaccines.





334

Figure 7. Graphical comparison of residual DNA concentration for spike (red) and ori (blue) determined by qPCR and total residual DNA concentration in individual vials as determined by Qubit. In panel A both Pfizer and Moderna data are plotted on the same scale. The Moderna data are enclosed in a red box and displayed separately with an enlarged scale in panel B, to display detail.

340

341 Other than Moderna lots AS0709D, AS0467D and 020G23A, VAERS reports were found 342 for all lots examined in this study (Figure 5). Of the 12 lots examined, the lots with the 343 highest numbers of reports filed to VAERS worldwide were FM7380 and FN7934 with 344 29 and 42 reports, respectively. In the case of lot FM7380, 15 individuals (52%) reported 345 an SAE, whereas for lot FN7934, 1 individual died, 2 individuals reported a disability, 346 and 18 reported being hospitalized with 21 (50%) SAEs. There were 9, 7, 5, 3, 2, and 2 347 reports filed for lots 062H21A, 020J21A, 020E21A, GK0932, 033M21A and 055K21A, 348 respectively. Of these lots, 5/7 (71%) reports for Moderna lot 020J21A involved 349 hospitalization, and there were 1/5 reports of death for Moderna lot 020E21A. In total there were 100 reports of AEs filed worldwide to VAERS for these lots; 48 (48%) of these 350 351 were SAEs. Most of these AE (n=92) and SAE (n=44) reports originated from outside the USA in similar proportion. Of these 92 AEs, 70 (76%) could be identified as 352 353 originating in Canada, with another 5 (5.4%) whose origin could not be determined. 354

In an exploratory analysis, we constructed dose-response curves by plotting (Figure 8) the mass of DNA for spike (red) and plasmid *ori* (blue) found in Pfizer (upper panel) and Moderna (lower panel) vials against the SAE reporting ratio (SRR). The *ori* and spike curves for the Pfizer product are similar to each other and show a positive dose-response relationship. The corresponding curves for the Moderna lots are shifted leftwards by one to two orders of magnitude. However, the *ori* and spike curves differ in position and slope.



362

Figure 8. Exploratory dose-response analysis comparing the concentration of residual DNA measured by qPCR for spike (red) and plasmid ori (blue) found in Pfizer (A) and Moderna (B) lots plotted against the SRR (reports of SAEs / total number of all adverse events reported to VAERS) for each lot from countries outside of the USA. Residual DNA mass per dose is plotted on a logarithmic scale. Data from the 1:10 dilution were used. 369 The corresponding plots for residual DNA estimated using fluorometry (Figure 9) yielded 370





372

373 **Figure 9.** Exploratory dose-response analysis comparing the concentration of residual 374 DNA measured by Qubit fluorometry for Pfizer (blue) and Moderna (red) vaccine lots plotted against the SRR (reports of SAEs / total number of all adverse events reported 375 to VAERS) from countries outside of the USA. Residual DNA mass per dose is plotted 376 on a logarithmic scale. 377

378

The Pfizer children's monovalent (Lot FL8095) described by McKernan et al.4 was 379 380 sequenced with Oxford Nanopore (ONT) to assess the read length distributions after 381 mapping the reads to the reference sequence of the plasmid in NCBI (Figure 8). The 382 longest read detected in 865 reads was 3.5 kb with read mapping to most of the plasmid 383 backbone (Figure 9).



384

Figure 10. Oxford Nanopore (ONT) read length distributions from 866 reads mapped to the vector sequence (NCBI OR134577.1). Mean = 214 bp. Max = 3.5 kb.



387

Figure 11. Longest Oxford Nanopore (ONT) read aligns to the vector region shown in blue. ori and spike primer locations are annotated on the innermost circle. Open reading frames (ORFs) are annotated in gold and green arrows. Kanamycin resistance genes were detected in a very shallow sequencing survey of the vaccine. 392 Nuclease sensitivity of the Pfizer vaccine was assessed using DNasel-XT. This DNA 393 nuclease is optimized for IVT reactions rich in RNA:DNA hybrids. This treatment showed 394 <1 Cq offset while a naked DNA control spiked into LNPs was reduced from a Cq of 15 395 to undetectable under the same conditions. This indicates that the DNA present in the 396 vaccines is protected by encapsulation in the LNPs (Figure 10, Figure 11).

Significant fractions of the LNPs are DNasel protected This implies 10-30% of the nucleic acid isn't packaged in an LNP





1 CT offset in DNase treatment = half of the nucleic acid being unpackaged.

398 Figure 12. DNase I-XT treatment of Pfizer vaccine demonstrates nuclease resistance of the DNA in the vaccines.

399



400

401 Figure 13. DNaseI-XT positive control demonstrates the digestion assay eliminates all spiked in DNA under the same conditions used to assess the vaccine nuclease 402 403 sensitivity.

404 **Discussion**

Residual DNA was detected in all 27 vaccine vials surveyed. Multiple vials from the same
lots produced very similar loads for all targets showing assay reliability, reproducibility,
and consistency within the lots. These data involving vaccine vials distributed in Canada
are consistent with several non-peer reviewed reports of DNA contamination in modRNA
vaccines (McKernan, Buckhaults, Konig).^{4 15 16}

410

411 Moderna had the lowest DNA concentration by qPCR but the highest concentration with 412 Qubit. The Moderna vials had the most consistent levels of DNA between vials 413 suggesting a more robust and standardized manufacturing process. In each vial of the 414 Moderna product, except for lot AS0467D, *ori* displayed lower loads than spike 415 suggesting a more effective removal of the vector DNA. Possibly, homologous modified 416 RNA may prevent digestion of template DNA by hybridization.¹⁷

417

418 The vials with the highest DNA concentration were from two lots of Pfizer monovalent 419 purple top vials with a phosphate buffered saline (PBS) formulation and require dilution 420 before administration. On October 29, 2021, the US FDA authorized a change of 421 formulation to a Tris/sucrose buffer; the grey topped monovalent adult vaccine and an 422 orange topped vaccine for children aged 6-11 years, This change was made to increase 423 stability, to simplify storage requirements and to provide a ready-to-use formulation.^{18 19} 424 These purple-topped Pfizer lots were also associated with the highest number of AEs 425 and SAEs reported in VAERS among all the lots tested. As the actual number of doses 426 administered for each lot is unknown, we used the total number of AEs as a proxy for 427 the number of doses administered as a denominator for the number of SAEs to estimate 428 toxicologic/pharmacologic effect. This uses the same principle used by CDC^{10 11} in its 429 disproportionality signal analysis (DSA).

430

Our exploratory analysis of the relationship between the residual DNA content and SAEs
reported to VAERS is preliminary and limited in sample size but warrants confirmation
by examining many more lots and vials. A positive dose-response relationship was
observed for the Pfizer lots based on qPCR estimation of residual DNA.

435 Different relationships were observed for Moderna lots for qPCR data as well as for plots 436 based on residual DNA estimated by fluorometry, for both Pfizer and Moderna lots. 437 These observations may reflect differences between the two products such as quantity 438 of DNA, the size distribution of DNA fragments, the composition and sequence of the 439 plasmid vector and composition of lipid nanoparticles. Other differences both between 440 the two products and between different lots of each product may also contribute to our 441 observations. These differences include variations in levels of contaminants or 442 impurities. One major source of impurity is fragmented mRNA for which a number of 443 toxicological mechanisms have been proposed such as its effects on miRNA 444 processes.²⁰ dsRNA is another type of impurity that occurs secondarily to the T7 RNA 445 polymerase promoter. dsRNA can induce pro-inflammatory cytokines²¹ and has been 446 hypothesized to contribute to immune-inflammatory reactions such as myocarditis.²² 447 Lipopolysaccharides in cells from endotoxin can bind both the S1 and S2 subunits of the 448 spike protein which may result in enhanced inflammatory responses.²³

449

Wider sampling will likely reveal greater detail in terms of event types, such as death, as well as comparisons with other works such as that reported by Schmeling *et al.*²⁴ who reported a correlation of AEs to various vaccine lot numbers²⁴. None of the presently studied vaccine lots were included in the Schmeling study and more work is needed to understand if and how this DNA contamination is related to AEs.

455

While the SV40 enhancer facilitates nuclear localization,^{6 25} genomic integration of DNA 456 457 fragments has yet to be demonstrated for the COVID-19 modRNA products.²⁶ However, 458 it is known that DNA contamination could trigger an unwarranted innate immune 459 response and may be prothrombotic, particularly for fragments with high GC content.²⁷ dsDNA may also be a significant factor in ischemic diseases including stroke.²⁸ While 460 461 there appears to be a correlation between high DNA contamination and SAEs more 462 research is needed to expand the sample size and elucidate any potential mechanism 463 at work.

465 It is important to emphasize that because qPCR cannot quantitate molecules smaller 466 than the size of the amplicon (105-114 bp), qPCR underestimates the total DNA in each 467 vaccine. This explains the large differences we have observed in residual DNA levels 468 estimated by qPCR compared with Qubit fluorometry particularly between the Pfizer and 469 Moderna products. The much larger values obtained for the Moderna product suggests 470 that there is a higher fraction of small fragmented residual DNA than in the Pfizer 471 product. This is consistent with a more thorough nuclease digestion step. This illustrates 472 the DNA contamination guidelines recommended by the FDA are highly dependent on 473 the methods used to quantitate the DNA. An alternative hypothesis to explain the high 474 fluorometric measurements is the unknown specificity of the DNA-tropic fluorometric 475 dyes when in use with samples that have high concentrations of N1-methyl-476 pseudouridine modRNA.

477

This fluorometry assessment is of particular interest as fluorometry and UV spectrophotometry were used to quantitate RNA in the Pfizer COVID-19 vaccines, as described in EMA documents³, while qPCR was used to quantitate DNA. This selective use of different methods to quantitate RNA/DNA ratios can lead to vastly different results for the ratio-metric guidelines in place at the EMA.

483

484 This elevated fluorometry quantitation compared to qPCR quantitation is consistent with 485 the ONT read length distributions that also suggest a portion of the DNA may be smaller 486 than the amplicon size. While the ONT sequencer detects molecules shorter than 100 487 bp, the methods for library construction for ONT use a 0.7X Ampure DNA purification 488 step which drastically selects against purifying molecules <150 bp in size. As a result, 489 the read length distributions for ONT reads are biased towards fragments >150 bp and 490 are not a perfect reflection of the smaller fragments that may be present and 491 undercounted by both ONT and qPCR.

492

493 Currently, the US FDA recommends manufacturers of viral vaccines to limit the amount 494 of residual DNA in the final product to below 10 ng/dose for parenteral inoculations and 495 the size of the DNA to below the size of a functional gene, or ~200 base pairs.¹³ This is also in keeping with recommendations from the World Health Organization (WHO).^{14 29}
Previous residual DNA levels were set by the FDA at 10pg/dose in 1985. A 1986 WHO
study group concluded that the risk is negligible up to 100 pg/dose and in 1996 the WHO
further increased levels up to 10 ng per dose.¹⁴

500

501 The FDA and WHO guidelines for allowable DNA in vaccines are influenced by work 502 published by FDA scientists Sheng-Fowler et al.³⁰ This work focused on host cell 503 genomic DNA contamination and made note of the increased number of molecules 504 present when small viral vectors are the contaminating species. For these high copy per 505 nanogram contaminants, femtograms to attograms of DNA are considered the 506 equivalent of nanograms of cell substrate genomic DNA. Given the short fragment size 507 in the modRNA vaccines, the number of molecules in each dose can reach over 100 508 billion molecules. The residual DNA in these vaccines is high in copy number and rich 509 in promoters, ORFs and nuclear targeting sequences. The FDA and WHO guidelines 510 did not consider packaging of DNA in lipid nanoparticles, likely resulting in longer DNA 511 persistence as well as increased transfection efficiency. Furthermore, the guidelines did 512 not consider cumulative dosing with LNP-based modRNA. In some cases, more than 513 five doses of COVID-19 vaccines have been administered with a dose interval for 514 booster doses sometimes as short as 2 months. Moreover, the risks of cumulative dosing 515 by vaccines targeting other infections but using the same plasmid and LNP-based 516 modRNA platform has not been considered in setting the residual DNA guidelines.

517

The FDA guidelines are also written to only quantitate DNA fragments of 200 bp or greater, in part because fragments smaller than this were not considered to be able to produce a functional gene. However, Klinman *et al.*,³¹ suggests that fragments as small as 7bp can pose integration risks. Furthermore, the guidelines may also have considered that fragments of naked DNA shorter than 200 bp would be more rapidly hydrolyzed by host nucleases activity than larger molecules.³² This accelerated destruction cannot be assumed of the vaccines due to the DNA being encapsulated and protected by the LNPs.

527 Klinman *et al.*,³¹ also observe that *"in evaluating the potential harm of plasmid* 528 *integration, it should be noted that the risk of introducing plasmids with strong regulatory* 529 *regions into the host genome far exceeds that associated with random point mutations."* 530

Finally, the guidelines do not consider if the residual DNA contains nuclear targeting
sequences and mammalian promoters that exist in the Pfizer vaccine.²⁶ Vacik *et al.*demonstrated that the SV40 enhancer present in the Pfizer vector is a potent nuclear
targeting sequence showing promise for gene therapy.²⁵

535

536 Conclusion

537 These data demonstrate the presence of billions to hundreds of billions of DNA 538 molecules per dose in the modRNA COVID-19 products tested. Using fluorometry, all 539 products tested exceeded the guidelines for residual DNA set by the FDA and WHO of 540 10 ng/dose by 188 – 509-fold. However, qPCR detected residual DNA content in all 541 products tested were below these guidelines emphasizing the importance of 542 methodological clarity and consistency when interpreting quantitative guidelines. The Cq 543 scores for the most recent XBB.1.5 Moderna vaccine suggest that DNA residues have 544 not been reduced from previous vaccine versions.

545

The preliminary evidence of a dose-response effect of residual DNA measured with qPCR and SAEs warrants confirmation and further investigation. Our findings extend existing concerns about vaccine safety and call into question the relevance of guidelines conceived before the introduction of efficient transfection using LNPs. With several obvious limitations, we urge that our work is replicated under forensic conditions and that guidelines be revised to account for highly efficient DNA transfection and cumulative dosing.

553

554 This work highlights the need for regulators and industry to adhere to the precautionary 555 principle, and provide sufficient and transparent evidence that products are safe and 556 effective, and disclose the details of their composition and method of manufacture.

558 Data Availability

- 559 Fastq file for the mapped ONT sequencing data:
- 560 https://mega.nz/file/UZhkiTBQ#8vjDK5JV5N5Dj2On34B6zdRObEKGBy3ZC7w8q2t9U
- 561 <u>Vc</u>
- 562

563 Acknowledgements

- 564 We thank all the pharmacists who donated to our endeavors.
- 565

566 Author Contributions

- 567 **DJ Speicher:** sample management, study design, qPCR, data analysis, manuscript
- 568 preparation
- 569 J Rose: VAERS analysis, manuscript preparation
- 570 LM Gutschi: data analysis, manuscript preparations
- 571 D Wiseman: data analysis, manuscript preparations
- 572 K McKernan: qPCR assay design, DNAsel and ONT experiments, manuscript
- 573 preparation
- 574

575 Conflict of Interest Statement

- 576 Kevin McKernan is employed by Medicinal Genomics and provided qPCR reagents free
- 577 of charge. The other authors declare that there are no conflicts of interest.
- 578

579 Revision History

580 2023-10-19 - version 1.0

581 **References**

- 582 1. Guetzkow JA. Letters to the editor: Effect of mRNA Vaccine Manufacturing Processes
 583 on Efficacy and Safety Still an Open Question. *BMJ* 2023;378:01731.
- 584 2. Tinari S. The EMA covid-19 data leak, and what it tells us about mRNA instability.
 585 *BMJ* 2021;372:n627. doi: 10.1136/bmj.n627 [published Online First: 20210310]
- 586 3. EMEA/H/C/005735/RR. Rapporteur Rolling Review Critial Assessment Report:
 587 Quality Aspects. 2020 [Available from: <u>https://covidvaccinereactions.com/ema-</u>
 588 <u>pfizer-leak/</u>.
- 4. McKernan K, Helbert Y, Kane LT, et al. Sequencing of bivalent Moderna and Pfizer
 mRNA vaccines reveals nanogram to microgram quantities of expression vector
 dsDNA per dose. *OSFio* 2023 doi: 10.31219/osf.io/b9t7m
- 592 5. Shimabukuro TT, Nguyen M, Martin D, et al. Safety monitoring in the Vaccine Adverse
 593 Event Reporting System (VAERS). *Vaccine* 2015;33(36):4398-405. doi:
 594 10.1016/j.vaccine.2015.07.035 [published Online First: 20150722]
- 595 6. Dean DA, Dean BS, Muller S, et al. Sequence requirements for plasmid nuclear
 596 import. *Exp Cell Res* 1999;253(2):713-22. doi: 10.1006/excr.1999.4716
- 5977.New England Biolabs.NEBioCalculator2023[Available from:598https://nebiocalculator.neb.com/#!/dsdnaamt2023.
- 8. R: The R Project for Statistical Computing [program]: R Foundation for StatisticalComputing, 2010.
- 9. Funk PR, Yogurtcu ON, Forshee RA, et al. Benefit-risk assessment of COVID-19
 vaccine, mRNA (Comirnaty) for age 16-29 years. *Vaccine* 2022;40(19):2781-89.
 doi: 10.1016/j.vaccine.2022.03.030 [published Online First: 20220328]

- 10. VAERS Team. Vaccine Adverse Event Reporting System (VAERS) Standard
 Operating Procedures for COVID-19 (as of 29 January 2021) 2021 [Available from:
 https://www.cdc.gov/vaccinesafety/pdf/VAERS-v2-SOP.pdf.
- Evans SJ, Waller PC, Davis S. Use of proportional reporting ratios (PRRs) for signal
 generation from spontaneous adverse drug reaction reports. *Pharmacoepidemiol Drug Saf* 2001;10(6):483-6. doi: 10.1002/pds.677
- Li H, Durbin R. Fast and accurate short read alignment with Burrows-Wheeler
 transform. *Bioinformatics* 2009;25(14):1754-60. doi:
 10.1093/bioinformatics/btp324 [published Online First: 20090518]
- Food and Drug Administration. Chemistry, Manufacturing, and Control (CMC)
 Information for Human Gene Therapy Investigational New Drug Applications
 (INDs): U.S. Department of Health and Human Services; 2020 [Available from:
 https://www.fda.gov/media/113760/download.
- 617 14. Shin J, Wood D, Robertson J, et al. WHO informal consultation on the application of
 618 molecular methods to assure the quality, safety and efficacy of vaccines, Geneva,
 619 Switzerland, 7-8 April 2005. *Biologicals* 2007;35(1):63-71. doi:
 620 10.1016/j.biologicals.2005.12.005 [published Online First: 20060220]
- 15. South Carolina Senate. SC Senate Hearing USC Professor Dr. Phillip Buckhaults
 2023 [updated 2023-09-13. Available from: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=IEWHhrHiiTY.
- 624 16. Koning B. Letter regarding the evidence presented to you of massive DNA
 625 contamination in BioNTech's COVID-19 mRNA vaccine.
 626 <u>https://www.genimpfstoffe.com/wp-content/uploads/2023/09/Verblindet-Fax-</u>
 627 <u>BMG-Lauterbach-16.-Sept-2023-1.pdf</u>, 2023.
- 528 17. Sutton DH, Conn GL, Brown T, et al. The dependence of DNase I activity on the
 529 conformation of oligodeoxynucleotides. *Biochem J* 1997;321 (Pt 2):481-6.
 630 doi: 10.1042/bj3210481

- 18. U.S. Food and Drug Administration. Emergency Use Authorization (EUA) for an
 Unapproved Product Review Memorandum 2021 [Available from:
 https://www.fda.gov/media/153947/download.
- Food and Drug Administration. Letter of Authorization 2023 [Available from:
 https://www.fda.gov/media/150386/download.
- Stati G, Amerio P, Nubile M, et al. Concern about the Effectiveness of mRNA
 Vaccination Technology and Its Long-Term Safety: Potential Interference on
 miRNA Machinery. *Int J Mol Sci* 2023;24(2) doi: 10.3390/ijms24021404 [published
 Online First: 20230111]
- 640 21. Nelson J, Sorensen EW, Mintri S, et al. Impact of mRNA chemistry and
 641 manufacturing process on innate immune activation. *Sci Adv*642 2020;6(26):eaaz6893. doi: 10.1126/sciadv.aaz6893 [published Online First:
 643 20200624]
- 644 22. Milano G, Gal J, Creisson A, et al. Myocarditis and COVID-19 mRNA vaccines: a
 645 mechanistic hypothesis involving dsRNA. *Future Virol* 2021 doi: 10.2217/fvl-2021646 0280 [published Online First: 20211206]
- 647 23. Samsudin F, Raghuvamsi P, Petruk G, et al. SARS-CoV-2 spike protein as a
 648 bacterial lipopolysaccharide delivery system in an overzealous inflammatory
 649 cascade. *J Mol Cell Biol* 2023;14(9) doi: 10.1093/jmcb/mjac058
- 650 24. Schmeling M, Manniche V, Hansen PR. Batch-dependent safety of the BNT162b2
 651 mRNA COVID-19 vaccine. *Eur J Clin Invest* 2023;53(8):e13998. doi:
 652 10.1111/eci.13998 [published Online First: 20230409]
- 653 25. Vacik J, Dean BS, Zimmer WE, et al. Cell-specific nuclear import of plasmid DNA.
 654 *Gene Ther* 1999;6(6):1006-14. doi: 10.1038/sj.gt.3300924

- 655 26. Lim S, Yocum RR, Silver PA, et al. High spontaneous integration rates of end656 modified linear DNAs upon mammalian cell transfection. *Sci Rep* 2023;13(1):6835.
 657 doi: 10.1038/s41598-023-33862-0 [published Online First: 20230426]
- 658 27. Gaitzsch E, Czermak T, Ribeiro A, et al. Double-stranded DNA induces a
 659 prothrombotic phenotype in the vascular endothelium. *Sci Rep* 2017;7(1):1112.
 660 doi: 10.1038/s41598-017-01148-x [published Online First: 20170425]
- 661 28. Ma X, Xin D, She R, et al. Novel insight into cGAS-STING pathway in ischemic
 662 stroke: from pre- to post-disease. *Frontiers in Immunology* 2023;14
- World Health Organization. Annex 3: Requirements for the use of animal cell cultures
 as substrates for the manufacture of biologic medicinal products and the
 characterization of cell banks. Replacement of Annex 1 of WHO Technical Report
 Series, No. 878. 2013 [Available from: https://cdn.who.int/media/docs/default-
 667 annex 3.pdf?sfvrsn=fe61af77_3&downloa
 668 documents/trs 978 annex 3.pdf?sfvrsn=fe61af77_3&downloa
- 30. Sheng-Fowler L, Lewis AM, Jr., Peden K. Issues associated with residual cellsubstrate DNA in viral vaccines. *Biologicals* 2009;37(3):190-5. doi:
 10.1016/j.biologicals.2009.02.015 [published Online First: 20090314]
- Klinman DM, Klaschik S, Tross D, et al. FDA guidance on prophylactic DNA
 vaccines: analysis and recommendations. *Vaccine* 2010;28(16):2801-5. doi:
 10.1016/j.vaccine.2009.11.025 [published Online First: 20091124]
- 32. André M, Reghin S, Boussard E, et al. Universal real-time PCR assay for quantitation
 and size evaluation of residual cell DNA in human viral vaccines. *Biologicals*2016;44(3):139-49. doi: 10.1016/j.biologicals.2016.03.002 [published Online First:
 20160328]
- 679